abstract

NEUROLOGICAL DISORDERS



Mutism in older adults is not uncommon. It is often confused with severe depression, locked-in syndrome, and persistent vegetative state, but it is important to distinguish among them as the management and prognosis are different. The family physician is the most consulted professional and so is the most helpful in making this distinction. Mutism is a neuropsychological disorder with marked heterogeneity among patients, raising the possibility of conditions such as advanced Alzheimer's disease, Jacob-Creutzfeldt disease, frontotemporal dementias, and certain psychiatric and psychological conditions. It is both a symptom and a syndrome, and is often associated with akinesia when the term akinetic mutism is used. Akinetic mutism has a number of causes with varied pathology and is characterized by a marked reduction in motor function, including facial expression, gestures, and speech output, with awareness being preserved. All of the disease manifestations can be explained by damage to the frontal lobe or interruption of the complex frontal subcortical circuits and the frontal diencephalic brain stem system by focal lesions or diffuse brain damage.

Key words: mutism, akinetic mutism, frontal-subcortical circuitry, locked-in-syndrome, persistent vegetative state

Mutism in the Older Adult

Nages Nagaratnam, MD, FRCP, FRACP, FRCPA, FACC, Consultant Physician, Geriatric Medicine, formerly Blacktown-Mount Druitt Health, Blacktown, New South Wales, Australia.

Gowrie Pavan, MBBS, FRAGP, General Practitioner, The Surgery, Plympton Road, Beecroft, New South Wales, Australia.

Introduction

By definition, mutism is the state or condition of being speechless. If speech occurs it is restricted to terse responses or monosyllables. Mutism is not uncommon in the older population. Since it is often caused by brain damage, mutism is considered a neurological disorder. However, it is also a psychological disorder and so can be more accurately termed a neuropsychological disorder. Mutism can be congenital or acquired when, as a result of damage to a part of the brain, the normally functioning psychological capability is altered. In mutism there is impairment of speech function and it is an articulatory disorder as opposed to aphasia, a disorder of linguistic processing (Figure 1).

The primary care physician must have a high degree of awareness or suspicion in patients presenting with varied clinical conditions that are often associated with mutism, and often erroneously diagnosed as depression, delirium, and locked-in-syndrome, amongst others.

Terminology and General Considerations

Terms such as apathy, abulia, and akinetic mutism (AM) are used to designate behavioural abnormalities relating to reduced activity and slowness. It is believed that these clinical disorders exist along a continuum of severity of reduced behaviour, and AM may be an extreme form.¹ The term abulia was initially used by Auerbach² and later called akinesia. Fischer³ used the term abulia to embrace the full spectrum of abnormalities, characterized by a reduction in speech, spontaneous activity, prolonged latency in responding to questions, and lack of persistence with tasks.

In 1865, Broca⁴ used the term aphemia to describe eight patients with loss of speech, which Trousseau later referred to as aphasia.⁵ Aphemia is now recognized as an articulatory disorder with normal propositional language. Aphemia has often been misdiagnosed as aphasia; this is partly due to confusion resulting from the numerous terms that have been used to describe this syndrome.⁶ In mutism, unlike in aphemia, the patient makes no attempt to communicate verbally or by gesture.⁷ Aphemia more often than not follows mutism.

Clinical Considerations

There is marked heterogeneity among patients with mutism, which raises the possibility of such varied conditions as advanced Alzheimer's disease, Pick's disease, and Creutzfeldt-Jakob Disease. It may also complicate certain psychiatric disorders including catatonic schizophrenia, severe depression, and conversion reaction. Mutism can be both a syndrome and a symptom, and is often associated with akinesia.

Akinetic Mutism

Following the landmark case report of Cairns *et al.*,⁸ the term akinetic mutism (AM) has been used to describe a syndrome characterized by marked reduction of nearly all motor functions, including facial expression, gestures, and speech output, but with some degree of alertness. Following this report, the term AM has been used in situations with similar clinical pictures associated with different etiologies and pathologies.

Mutism in the Older Adult



Depending on the clinical picture, AM had been subdivided into two pathology types based on the anatomic location of the lesion. One is related to the mesencephalic region and is described as apathetic akinetic mutism or somnolent mutism. The other is known as hyperpathic akinetic mutism and is associated with bilateral frontal damage (Figure 2).⁹

The critical areas involved are the frontal lobe (cingulate gyrus, supplementary motor area [SMA], and the dorso-lateral border zones), basal ganglia (caudate and putamen), and the mesencephalus and thalamus.¹⁰ The vascular syndromes giving rise to AM are the most striking, particularly those related to the anterior cerebral artery (ACA) which could be either unilateral or bilateral, transient or prolonged. Neuroimaging is an important diagnostic test (Figure 3). Apart from cerebral infarction or hemorrhage,¹¹ a

variety of focal pathologies can produce AM.^{8,12–15} CJD is a rapidly progressive disease, characterized by dementia and myoclonus, and is highly protean in its manifestations. AM has been described as a symptom of CJD and included as a classification criterion for its diagnosis.¹⁴ AM commences within an average of 7.5 weeks in CJD.¹⁶

Lim *et al.*¹⁵ described AM with findings of white matter intensities. There are two types of white matter changes: periventricular and deep white matter lesions. The deep matter lesions are separate from the ventricles; they have a different pathogenesis.¹⁷ There are several causes for these lesions apart from normal aging, but the more severe types can be associated with atherosclerotic disease.^{18,19} According to some investigators, these changes detected by computed tomography or solely by magnetic resonance imaging have different meanings, and when these changes are seen on the CT they may indicate associated dementia.²⁰

Somnolent AM of the mesencephalic type can vary in intensity.^{9,21} AM has been reported after thalamic lesions^{22,23} and thalamocapsular lesions.¹³ Brown²⁴ identified two broad classes of disturbances with unilateral left thalamic lesions: one showing AM, often with a stuporose state, and the other with a fluent type of speech disorder.

AM is often erroneously diagnosed as locked-in syndrome or persistent vegetative state. Distinguishing between them is important because management differs. The distinguishing characteristics are shown in Table 1. The blunted emotional expression and apathy in patients with severe depression, together with psychomotor retardation such as slurred speech and body movements, may mimic AM.

Chronic Neurological Disorders

There are a number of chronic neurological disorders that exhibit pseudobulbar or bulbar palsy (dysarthria and dysphagia) and in which mutism supervenes. In pseudobulbar palsy there are bilateral lesions following cerebrovascular incidents resulting in involvement of the corticobulbar pathways; this causes dysarthria, dysphagia, and slow tongue movements together with corticospinal tract signs. Progressive supranuclear palsy (PSP) is a nonfamilial progressive disorder of gait and balance with supranuclear gaze palsy, bradykinesia, and pseudobulbar palsy. Motor neurone disease (progressive bulbar palsy and amyotrophic lateral sclerosis) is characterized by progressive degeneration of the corticospinal tracts, anterior horn cells, and/or bulbar motor nuclei. In Parkinson's disease the speech is characterised by hypophonia, dysarthria, reduced variability of rhythm and pitch, and, finally, unintelligible speech.

Dementias

In frontotemporal dementia (FTD), emphasis on one or other of the lobes has led to two main types: frontal variant²⁶ and temporal variant.27 Prominent manifestations of the temporal subtype are language disturbance (primary progressive aphasia) and behavioural disorders. According to Kertesz and Munoz,²⁸ mutism is a mid-stage characteristic heedless of how this group of illnesses begin. It tends to be the end stage characteristic of all forms of FTDs (now referred to as the Pick's complex) irrespective of whether they present with disturbance of behaviour or language. There are few initial neurological signs but with progression, striatal signs of akinesia and rigidity emerge.29,30

Aphasia is one of the essential requirements for the diagnosis of Alzheimer's disease, along with agnosia and apraxia. The aphasia of Alzheimer's disease often fits with an extrasylvian pattern.³¹ Initially, the patients have an anomic aphasia, followed by a transcortical sensory aphasia or Wernicke's aphasia.³² As the dementia progresses there is

decreased fluency together with perseveration, echolalia, and nonspeech utterances such as grunting to complete dissolution of speech. These features are rarely seen in patients with global aphasia following stroke.³³

Binswanger's disease (BD), or subacute arteriosclerotic encephalopathy, is characterized by diffuse demyelination of the white matter with lacunar lesions in the basal ganglia and brain stem. Depending on the location and severity of the lesion, a variety of symptom-clusters may emerge. Clinically, it is characterized by disorders of memory, cognition, and mood changes together with pyramidal and extrapyramidal abnormalities. Pseudobulbar palsy (dysarthria and dysphagia) is frequent.

Primary Psychiatric Disorders Catatonia

Stupor and excitement are outstanding catatonic symptoms. A patient in stupor is unresponsive and, although fully conscious, is immobile and mute. The stupor may suddenly change to excitement and increased motor activity.³⁴ These patients are usually adolescents and young adults; however, onset in late life is not uncommon.

Psychological

In hysterical mutism there is an obstinate and voluntary silence that is not accompanied by any abnormality in the muscles of articulation. The patient is able to cough normally. There is a psychological component in conversion disorders and the patient mimics a pathophysiological disorder such as paralysis or amongst others, loss of vision. Any symptom may become a conversion symptom.

Neuroanatomic Correlates

The frontal lobe plays an important role in behaviour and speech.

Supplementary Motor Areas

The supplementary motor areas (SMAs) have extensive afferent and efferent connections with the motor and premotor cortex.³⁵ The SMAs are concerned with programming motor subroutines before voluntary



movements can be executed. The right SMA is concerned with activation of the motor output³⁶ and the left SMA is less involved with motor activation but is more concerned with sequencing of primary motor routines. Impaired functioning of the SMA could give rise to abnormalities of Parkinsonian motor programme, and the SMA acts as the "energizer unit."37 Tremor, rigidity, and akinesia have been described following a low grade glioma involving the left SMA.38 Petrovic39 described eight patients with tumours of the SMA who could be categorized into two types: one with speech block, aphemia (mutism), and reiteration, and the other group with dysphasic manifestations occurring with lesions of the speech dominant hemisphere.

Cingulate Gyrus

The anterior cingulate gyrus is very similar to the SMA which has connections with the cingulate gyrus.³⁷ The anterior cingulate gyrus has short connections with the dorso-lateral prefrontal cortex. Lesions of the cingulate gyrus, SMA, or both give rise to akinesia and mutism with restriction of spontaneous activity.³⁶ The anterior cingulate influences goaldirected behaviour through the cortical gateway for limbic motivation.⁴⁰ AM is typically associated with bilateral anterior cingulate lesions.^{41,42}

Basal Ganglia

AM has been reported following bilateral globus pallidal lesions.^{43,44} De Long and Georgepolous⁴⁵ proposed a relationship between basal ganglia and the frontal cortical areas through a concept of motor and complex loops (Figure 4A). Lesions of the loop may therefore cause SMA dysfunction, and SMA dysfunction may lead to akinesia.⁴⁶

Paramedian Diencephalic and Midbrain

AM also results from bilateral subcortical paramedian diencephalic and midbrain lesions.^{8,23} The mesencephalic-diencephalic reticular activating system—which includes the midbrain, reticular formation, thalamus, and hypothalamus—has projections to the frontal lobe.^{9,13}

Alexander *et al.*⁴⁸ described five frontal-subcortical circuits according to their function or cortical site. The motor and oculomotor circuits are associated with sensorimotor functions; the dorsolateral prefrontal and the orbitofrontal circuits are associated with cognitive functions, and the anterior cingulate circuit (medial frontal) with limbic mechanisms,45 featuring reduced motivation, interest activity, maintenance, and apathy. Each circuit includes the frontal lobe, striatum, globus pallidus/substantia nigra thalamus, and connecting links between these structures.⁵⁰ The dorsallateral prefrontal circuit originates from the lateral convexity of the frontal lobe anterior to the premotor area and the circuit structures include the caudate nucleus, globus pallidus, substantia nigra, and ventral anterior dorsal medial nuclei of the thalamus. The medial frontal circuit begins in the anterior cingulate cortex and the circuit includes the nucleus accumbens (also known as the limbic striatum), globus pallidus, substantia nigra, and the medial dorsal nucleus of the thalamus. Damage to these areas or interruption of the circuit either by focal lesions or by diffuse brain damage could give rise to mutism and akinesia.

Treatment

A Trial with Dopaminergic Therapy

There are three dopaminergic pathways, namely the striatonigral pathway

Table 1: Differential Diagnosis of Akinetic Mutism			
Symptoms and Signs	Akinetic Mutism	Locked-In Syndrome	Persistent Vegetative State
wakefulness	present	present	cycles of eye opening and closure
alertness	present	present	none
awareness	present	present	none
attentiveness	present	present	none
Communication			
speech output	reduced (occasionally in monosyllables)	nil (able to with eye and head movements)	nil
motor responses	reduced	as above	none purposeful
cognition	not for higher cognitive responses	near normal	none
localization of lesion	cingulate gyrus SMA, mesencephalo-thalamic	ventral pons	diffuse cortical damage
prognosis	transient or prolonged (usually days to few months)	persistent	poor
Source: Adapted from TBI and limited overt responsiveness: Nebraska's Brain Injury Resource Network. ²⁵			





(substantia nigra to caudate and putamen), the mesolimbic pathway (ventral tegmental area of midbrain to limbic areas of basal forebrain), and the mesocortical pathway (ventral tegmental area of midbrain to frontal and cingulate cortices) (Figure 4B). Destruction of the ascending dopaminergic pathway, blocking of dopamine receptors by drugs, inhibition of dopamine synthesis, or prevention of dopamine storage has been shown to induce akinesia on animals in experimental studies. Drugs that release dopamine or act as dopamine agonists have been shown to increase the motor activity in experimental animals.⁵⁰ In Parkinson's disease (PD), the striatonigral outflow does not function normally because of the degeneration of the dopaminergic cells in the substantia nigra. The SMA appears to be the major target of a disordered nigrostriatal-thalamic outflow in PD. The striatum receiving inadequate dopaminergic stimulation results in functional deafferentation of the SMA and thereby gives rise to a defect in motor programming.

Results for the use of dopaminergic agonists in AM have been varied, which may be due to the site of the lesion giving rise to the AM. In one study of four patients who had global akinesia followed by hypokinesia, bradykinesia, and hypometria due to anterior cerebral artery infarction with damage to the SMA, there was poor response to dopamine agonists.⁵¹ A patient with AM following bilateral damage to the anterior hypothalamus responded to treatment with bromocriptine, a direct dopaminergic receptor agonist.⁵² The reason for this response, according to the investigators, was that the lesion was anterior to the site at which the nigrostriatal fibres diverge from the median forebrain bundle.

AM is a clinical syndrome, and the lesions implicated are in the mesencephalic-frontal activating system, which is a dopaminergic pathway. However, it has different etiologies and pathologies that are liable to be induced by diverse localized lesions, and as such, there is no one treatment, pharmacological or nonpharmacological, for AM.

Use of Communicator Devices

One major source of disability in chronic neurological disorders in patients with pseudobulbar palsy is impaired communication. For the replacement of the voice in anarthritic and severely dysarthritic patients there are communication devices to augment other forms of communication therapy. The Canon communicator is a like a mini-typewriter with typed messages on strips of paper. Patients unable to use their hands can use an eye communicator.

Conclusion

Mutism is a neuropsychological disorder and is not uncommon in older adults. It is often mistaken for locked-in syndrome, severe depression, or persistent vegetative state. Mutism is both a symptom and a syndrome. It is often associated with such diverse conditions as advanced Alzheimer's disease, frontotemporal dementias, and certain other psychiatric and psychological disorders. When akinesia occurs concomitantly, the term akinetic mutism is used. Akinetic mutism has a number of causal factors with varied pathology. All of its manifestations can be explained by focal or diffuse brain lesions causing damage to the frontal lobe and/or interruption of the complex frontal subcortical circuits and frontal diencephalic brain stem system. A trial with dopaminergic therapy is justifiable in patients with AM associated with vascular lesions. Communicator devices are available to augment communication in patients with anarthria or severe dysarthria.

No competing financial interests declared.

References

- Caplan LR, Schmahmann JD, Kase CS, et al. Caudate infarcts. Arch Neurol 1990;47:133–42.
- Auerbach S. Beitrag zur Diagnostic der Geshwulste des Stirnhirm. Disch Nervenheilkd 1902;22;312–32.
- Fisher CM. Abulia: minor versus agitated behaviour. Clin Neurosurg 1983;31:9–31.
- 4. Broca P. Sur la faculte du langage articule. Bull Soc Anthropol Paris 1865;6:337–73.
- 5. Pearce JMS. Aphasia or aphemia. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 2001;70:801.
- Schiff HB, Alexander MD, Nasser MB, et al. Aphemia: clinical anatomic correlations. Arch Neurol 1983;40:720–7.

- Damasio AR, Anderson SW. The frontal lobes. In: Heilman KM, Valenstein SW, editors. Clinical Neuropsychology. 3rd ed. Oxford University Press, 1993: 434.
- Cairns H, Oldfield HC, Pennybacker JB, et al. Akinetic mutism with an epidermoid cyst of the third ventricle. Brain 1941;34:23–9.
- Segarra JM. Cerebrovascular disease and behaviour, I: the syndrome of the mesencephalic artery. Arch Neurol 1970;22:401–18.
- Nagaratnam N, Nagaratnam K, Ng K, et al. Akinetic mutism following stroke. J Clin Neurosci 2004;11:25–30.
- Nagaratnam N, Fanello S, Gopinath S, et al. Prolonged abulia following putaminal haemorrhage. J Stroke Cerebrovasc Dis 2001;10:92–3.
- Scott TF, Lang D, Girgis RH, et al. Prolonged akinetic mutism due to multiple sclerosis. J Neuropsychiat Clin Neurosci 1995;7:385–6.
- Park-Matsumoto YC, Ogawa K, Tazawa T, et al. Mutism developing after bilateral thalamo-capsular lesions by neuro-Bechet disease. Acta Neurol Scand 1995;91:297–301.
- Otto A, Zerr I, Lantsch M, et al. Akinetic mutism as a classification criterion for the diagnosis of Creutzfeldt-Jakob disease. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1998;64:524–8.
- Lim GT, Mendez MF, Bronstein YL, et al. Akinetic mutism with findings of white matter hyperintensities. J Neuropsychiat Clin Neurosci 2002;14:214–21.
- Hansen HC, Zschocke S, Sturenburg HJ, et al. Clinical changes and EEG patterns preceding the onset of periodic sharp wave complexes in Creutzfeldt-Jakob disease. Acta Neurol Scand 1998;97:99–110.
- O'Brien J. Neuroimaging in vascular dementia. In: Chiu E, Gustafson L, Ames D, et al., editors. Cerebrovascular disease and dementia. London: Martin Dunitz Ltd., 2002: 51.
- Fazekas F, Kleinert R. Offenbacher H, et al. Pathological correlations of incidental MRI white matter signal hyperintensities. Neurology 1993;43:1683–9.
- Schelters PH, Kamphoist W, Barkhol F, et al. Histopathological correlates of white matter changes on MRI in Alzheimer's disease and normal aging. Neurology 1995;45:813–18.
- Kobari M, Meyer JS, Ichigo M. Leuko-araiosis, cerebral atrophy and cerebral perfusion in normal aging. Arch Neurol 1990;47:161.
- Nagaratnam N, McNeil C, Gilhotra JS. Akinetic mutism and mixed transcortical aphasia following left thalamo-mesenecephalic infarction. J Neurol Sci 1999;34:70–3.
- 22. Craviota H, Silberman J. A clinical and pathological study of akinetic mutism. Neurology 1960;10:10–21.
- Kemper TL, Romanul FCA. State resembling akinetic mutism in basilar artery occlusion. Neurology 1967;17:74–80.
- 24. Brown JW. Language cognition and the thalamus. Confin Neurologic 1979:36:35–64.

- Nebraska's Brain Injury Resource Network. TBI and limited overt responsiveness. NE Brainstorm: Nebraska Department of Education, 2005: www.nde.state.ne.us/tbi/ overt responsiveness.html
- Gregory CA, Serra-Mastios J, Hodges JR. Early diagnosis of the frontal variant of frontotemporal dementia: How sensitive are standard neuroimaging and neuropsychological tests? Neuropsychiat Neuropsychol Behav Neurol 1999;12:128–35.
- Edwards-Lee T, Miller BL, Benson DT, et al. The temporal variant of frontotemporal dementia. Brain 1997;120:1027–40.
- Kertesz A, Munoz DG. Primary progressive aphasia: a review of the neurobiology of a common presentation of Pick complex. Amer J Alz Dis 2002;17:30–6.
- 29. Neary D. Neuropsychological aspects of frontotemporal degeneration. In: Grafman J, Holyoak KJ, Boller F, editors. Structure and functions of the human prefrontal cortex. New York: Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences 1996:15–22.
- Nagaratnam N, Cheuk G, Nagaratnam K. Slowly progressive aphasia with striatal involvement. Amer J Alz Dis 2002;17:18–22.
- Cummings JL, Benson DF, Hill MA, et al. Aphasia in dementia of the Alzheimer type. Neurology 1985:35:394–7.
- Kertsz A, Appell J, Fisman M M. The dissolution of language in Alzheimer's disease. Can J Neurosci 1986;13:415–8.
- Appell J, Kertesz A, Fissman M. A study of language functioning in Alzheimer's patients. Brain Lang 1982;17:73–91.
- Gelder M, Gath D. Maypu R. Schizophrenia. In: Oxford Textbook of Psychiatry. Oxford Medical Publications, 1983; 232.
- Damasio A, Van Hoesen GW. Structure and function of the supplementary motor area. Neurology 1980;30:359.
- Meador KJ, Watson RT, Bowers D, et al. Hypometria with hemispatial and limb motor neglect. Brain 1985;109:293–305.
- Damasio AR, Vandenstein GW. Structure and function of the supplementary area. Neurology 1980;30:300–59.
- Straube A, Sigel K. Parkinsonian syndrome caused by a tumour of the left supplementary motor area. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 1988;51:730–1.
- Petrovic JN. Speech disorders in tumours of the supplementary motor area. Zentralbl Neurochir 1983;44:97–114.
- Mega MS, Cummings JL. The cingulate and cingulate syndromes. In: Trimble MR, Cummings JL, editors. Contemporary Behavioural Neurology. Boston: Butterworth-Heinemann, 1997: 189–214.
- Amyes EW, Neilson JM. Bilateral anterior cingulate gyrus lesions. Bull Los Angeles Neuro Sci 1953;18:48–57.
- Barris RW, Schuman HR. Bilateral anterior cingulate gyrus lesions. Neurology 1953;3:44–52.
- 43. Hawker K, Lang AF. Hypoxic-ischaemic

damage of the basal ganglia. Mov Disord 1990;5:219–24.

- Mega MS, Cohenour RC. Akinetic mutism: disconnection of frontal subcortical circuits. Neuropsychiatry Neuropsychol Behav Neurol 1997;10:654–9.
- De Long HR, Georgepolous AF. Motor functions of the basal ganglia as revealed by studies of single cell activity in the behaving primate. Arch Neurol 1979;24:131–40.
- Heilman KM, Rothi LJG. Apraxia. In: Heilman KM, Valenstein SW, editors. Clinical neuropsychology. New York: Oxford University Press, 1993:153.
- Bell DS. Speech functions of the thalamus inferred from the effects of thalamotomy. Brain 1968;91:619–38.
- Alexander GE, Delaneyy MR, Strick PL. Parallel organisations of functionally segregated circuits linking basal cortex and cortex. Ann Rev Neurosci 1990;9:357–81.
- Cummings Jl. Fronto-subcortical circuits and human behaviour. Arch Neurol 1993;50:873–80.
- De Long AR, Georgopolous AP. Motor functions of the basal ganglia. In : Brockhurst JM, Mountcastle VB, editors. Handbook of physiology, Section 1, Vol.2. Mountcastle: American Physiological Society, 1981:1017–61.
- Nagaratnan N, Nagaratnam K. Parkinsonian syndrome following anterior cerebral artery infarction. Eur J Int Med 1992;3:345–50.
- Stewart JT, Leadon M, Gonzalez-Rothi IJ. Treatment of a case of akinetic mutism with bromocriptine. J Neuropsychiat Clin Neurosci 1990;2:462–3.